

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

-----X :  
CHRISTOPHER E. BROWN, :

Plaintiff, :

-against- :

ST. JOHN'S UNIVERSITY and GCA SERVICES  
GROUP, INC., and BUTLER ROGERS BASKETT  
ARCHITECTS, P.C., and HM WHITE SITE  
ARCHITECTS and SKANSKA USA BUILDING,  
INC. and LANGAN ENGINEERING AND  
ENVIRONMENTAL  
SERVICES, INC., :

Defendants :

-----X :  
ST. JOHN'S UNIVERSITY, :

Third-Party Plaintiff, :

-against- :

GCA SERVICES GROUP, INC., and  
BUTLER ROGERS BASKETT, :

Third-Party Defendants. :

-----X :  
BUTLER ROGERS BASKETT, :

Fourth-Party Plaintiff, :

-against- :

HM WHITE SITE ARCHITECTS, SKANSKA USA  
BUILDING, INC. and LANGAN ENGINEERING  
AND ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES, INC., :

Fourth-Party Defendants. :

Civ. Action No. 08-cv-2218 (ARR)

Hon. J. Ross

Hon. M.J. Pohorelsky

**MEMORANDUM OF LAW  
IN SUPPORT OF ST.  
JOHN'S UNIVERSITY'S  
MOTION TO DISMISS  
COUNT II OF PLAINTIFF'S  
FIRST AMENDED  
COMPLAINT**

### **PRELIMINARY STATEMENT**

Defendant/Third-Party Plaintiff ST. JOHN'S UNIVERSITY ("St. John's") moves to dismiss Count II of Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(c), and hereby adopt and incorporate herein the arguments set forth in the motion papers set submitted by co-defendant LANGAN ENGINEERING AND ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES, INC. ("Langan"). As more fully argued therein, plaintiff's claims are meritless under N.Y. Civil Rights Law § 40-c and §40-d. For these reasons, Count II of plaintiff's First Amended Complaint must be dismissed.

### **STATEMENT OF FACTS**

St. John's refers the Court to defendant Langan's Memorandum of Law in support of its motion to dismiss Count II of Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint for a full recitation of the facts and applicable law.

### **ARGUMENT**

In essence, plaintiff asserts claims under N.Y. Civil Rights Law §40-c and §40-d against all defendants. However, plaintiff's interpretations of these sections are erroneous. As aptly explicated by Langan, §40-d grants a cause of action only against a "person" who commits a discriminatory act prohibited under §40-c. St. John's is undisputedly a private Catholic university and thus, cannot be considered a "person" as contemplated by §40-c. Additionally, plaintiff's counsel failed to properly provide notice to the New York Attorney General of plaintiff's intention to bring a claim against St. John's as required under §40-d. Moreover, Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint fails to allege that any defendant intentionally discriminated against him on the basis of his disability. For these reasons, as more fully set forth in the motion

papers submitted by Langan that are adopted and incorporated herein, St. John's requests that Count II of Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint be dismissed.

**CONCLUSION**

For the foregoing reasons, it is respectfully requested that the Court dismiss Count II of Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint prejudice.

Dated: New York, New York  
November 23, 2009

Yours, *etc.*,

Biedermann, Reif, Hoenig & Ruff, P.C.

By:



Elaine N. Chou (EC7688)

Attorneys for Defendant/Third-Party Plaintiff  
St. John's University  
570 Lexington Avenue  
New York, New York 10022  
(212) 697-6555

TO: ALL COUNSEL OF ECF SERVICE LIST

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 25<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2009, I electronically filed the foregoing **MEMORANDUM OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF ST. JOHN'S UNIVERSITY'S MOTION TO DISMISS COUNT II OF PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT** with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of filing to the following e-mail addresses:

J. Justin Griffin, Esq.  
Ku & Mussman, P.A.  
***Attorneys for Plaintiff, CHRISTOPHER BROWN***  
64 Oriole Street  
Pearl River, New York 10965  
Tel: 845-499-9121  
Fax: 305-891-4512  
[jjg10@hotmail.com](mailto:jjg10@hotmail.com)

Louis Mussman, Esq.  
Ku & Mussman, P.A.  
***Attorneys for Plaintiff, CHRISTOPHER BROWN***  
11098 Biscayne Blvd, Suite 301  
Miami, Florida 33161  
Tel: 305-891-1322  
Fax: 305-891-4512  
[louis@kumussman.com](mailto:louis@kumussman.com)

Robert A. Banner, Esq.  
Kevin J. McGrath, Esq.  
Ingram Yuzek Gainen Carroll & Bertolotti, LLP  
***Attorneys for BUTLER ROGERS BASKETT***  
250 Park Avenue  
New York, New York 10177  
Tel.: 212-907-9600  
Fax: 212-907-9681  
[rbanner@ingramllp.com](mailto:rbanner@ingramllp.com)  
[kmcgrath@ingramllp.com](mailto:kmcgrath@ingramllp.com)

Eyal Steven Eisig, Esq.  
Stephen P. Schreckinger, Esq.  
Gogick, Byrne & O'Neill, LLP  
***Attorneys for HW WHITE SITE ARCHITECTS***  
11 Broadway, Suite 1560  
New York, New York 10004-1314  
Tel: 212-422-9424  
Fax: 212-422-9429  
[ese@gogick.com](mailto:ese@gogick.com)  
[sps@gogick.com](mailto:sps@gogick.com)

Michael S. Bubbs, Esq.  
Bubbs Grogan & Cocca LLP  
***Attorneys for SKANSKA USA BUILDING, INC.***  
25 Prospect Street  
Morristown, New Jersey 08960  
Tel: 973-539.6500  
Fax: 212-539-6409  
[mbubbs@bgc-law.com](mailto:mbubbs@bgc-law.com)

Christopher L. Deininger, Esq.  
Casey & Barnett LLP  
317 Madison Avenue  
New York, New York 10017  
Tel: 973-879-1610  
Fax: 212-286-0261  
[cdeininger@aol.com](mailto:cdeininger@aol.com)

William J. Brennan, Esq.  
Sedgwick Detert Moran & Arnold LLP  
***Attorneys for LANGAN ENGINEERING AND ENVIRONMENTAL SERVICES, INC.***  
125 Broad Street. 39<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York. New York 10004  
Tel: 212-422.0202  
Fax: 212-422-0925  
[William.Brennan@sdma.com](mailto:William.Brennan@sdma.com)

Allen Gueldenzopf, Esq.  
Law Offices of James J. Toomey  
***Attorneys for GCA SERVICES, INC.***  
485 Lexington Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, New York 10017  
Tel: 917-778-6659  
Fax: 917-778-7020  
[aguelden@travelers.com](mailto:aguelden@travelers.com); [toomlaw1@travelers.com](mailto:toomlaw1@travelers.com)

  
Savi Ramprasad